Legal framework of organ donation in the UK and abroad: are we progressive enough?

11 October 2010
Baroness Diana Warwick, Chair
Overview

- Brief overview of the frameworks for living and deceased donation in the UK

- Principles of the French, Dutch, Spanish and US frameworks for donation

- Questions that you may wish to consider during the panel discussion
Where are we today in the UK?

Deceased Donation

- Opt-in system
- Consent is vital
- Supported by NHSBT who seek to increase the number of people on the Organ Donor Register
- Allocation system based on need and closeness of match
Where are we today in the UK?

Living Donation

- Consent is vital
- Payment is illegal
- Safeguards against duress, coercion and reward
- Established forms of donation are between friends and family members; also altruistic and paired/pooled donations
- All donations require HTA approval; some specifically by a panel of authority members
The UK system in numbers

Deceased Donation
- 959 donors in 2009/10
- Over 17 million registrants on the ODR
- 8001 people on the waiting list

Living Donation
- 1140 donations approved by the HTA in 2009/10
- Increase of 8% year on year
- A 5% drop in living organ donations compared with this time last year
The French system

Deceased Donation
- Presumed consent
- 1563 donors in 2008
- 7692 people on the waiting list (2008)

Living Donation
- Limited group of people can donate
- Decision is made by a panel of experts
- Payment is illegal
The Dutch system

Deceased Donation
- Opt in
- 215 donors in 2009
- 1286 on the waiting list (2009)
- Deceased donation numbers have been static for the last 20 years

Living Donation
- Widely viewed as leading in living organ donation
- Successful altruistic and paired/pooled schemes
- Continuing to increase in the number of domino paired kidney exchange donations

HTA
Human Tissue Authority
The Spanish system

Deceased Donation
- Presumed consent
- Use of specially trained staff to approach relatives

Living Donation
- Significantly lower than deceased figures
- Not routinely offered as an option to renal patients

Numbers
- Total number of transplants in 2009 – 1606
- 96% of these were from deceased donors
## European countries in numbers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Deceased donors per million population</th>
<th>Living donors per million population</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>25.3</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>28.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>25.1</td>
<td>37.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>34.2</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>37.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The US system

Deceased Donation
- Opt in system
- 8022 donors in 2009
- Over 108,000 on the waiting list

Living Donation
- Appointment of Independent Donor Advocates (IDA)
- Payment for organs is illegal
- 6609 living donations in 2009
Where from here?

Deceased Donation
- Continuing to promote discussion of donation
- Discussion on presumed consent is ongoing
- Increase in the number of SN-ODs over the past year
- Continuing to increase number of ODR registrants

Living Donation
- New forms of living donation becoming a possibility
- Continuing to increase awareness
Questions for consideration

- Should we continue to focus on a mixed approach, supporting both deceased and living donation?
- Should the transplant community take the initiative to press for presumed consent?
- Where can we continue to make improvements with limited resources?
- Should we continue to safeguard against duress, coercion and reward in living donation?
Thank You

www.hta.gov.uk